

Case studies or stories - what to choose

Linnéa A. J. Eriksson

Halmstad University

Dated December 2016

ABSTRACT

Stories are a natural part of a human living but teachers today still choose to not use stories in education. The purpose with this paper is to bring forward elements that stories miss compared with case studies. Both a story and case studies involve the readers to think free and act. Stories are created by the narrative sources with lack of evidence of truth. The Bible is a type of narrative stories, which has received much criticism and questioned the biblical narratives credibility. Human how listening to the stories must according to Fines and Nichol (1997) be very active and have a critical thinking to everything they hear and daring in the question by putting counterarguments.

Keyword: Case studies, stories, education, The Bible, critical source.

INTRODUCTION

People these days are natural storytellers and listeners. Stories are an integral part of human existence and stories have the great power to change or affect people thoughts and opinions, Kosa (2008). This article is aimed to describe the differences between case studies and stories and answer the question why teachers don't tell stories instead of cases in education.

According to Yin (2003) case study is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context, especially when the

boundary of phenomenon and context are not clearly evident. A case study is defined, Feagin, Orum and Sjoberg (1991), as a research method that has a purpose to get a deeper knowledge of a special topic. The authors conclude that a case study focuses on the study of an issue in order to create a detailed information and knowledge in the issue. Pettigrew (1990) considers that case studies are complicated because the result cannot be explained with a few variables. The author means that the writer needs a lot of knowledge of the issue to have the opportunity to write good

case studies. Teachers have the opportunity to influence what and how students learn, consider Kosa (2008). A story is limited because it must have a beginning and an end describes Szurmak and Thuna (2013).

Stories can bring emotion which can describes as an engine of the brain activity and emotional engagement leads to the desire to seek for meaning. In Boström (2008) opinion, the human brain learns best when facts are embedded and new skills are grounded in natural contexts with practical examples.

According to Wadenström (2005) history can be a fictional story or a depiction of the past. There are also two types of depictions, this may be a depiction of research or a remarkable occurrence, considers Wadenström (2005). For the narrative sources, particularly in history depends, tendency and proximity of important criteria for review. This is precisely because the narrator forgets details and information distorted and contexts change, Rösen, (2004).

The questions are can teacher not just tell stories instead? What is lost in stories that are gained in cases?

METHODOLOGY

The sense of this research is to discover is case studies or stories – what to choose. The main factor is why teacher don't use stories instead of case studies in education. The understanding of how the method will be presented is necessary for researchers in all fields, describes Hahn Fox and Jennings (2014). According to the writer one of the most important parts in the article is the method. This is according to the fact that the readers use the information in the method to interpret the validity and evaluate the quality of the article, describe the writers.

To gather relevant information to answer the question and find reliable information to the research the method will endure a qualitative secondary research. Databases as Web of Science and Scopus have been used to find information. As the academic literature and scientific articles are the basis for the working method, then a similar study conducted and shows the same results again. This shows, according to Jacobsen (2002), a study has high reliability.

The validity of this text is achieved by seeking answers in observed area. Kallet (2004) explains that the purpose of the methodology section is to accurately and clearly describe the research and collection of analysing data. The title has been used to identify keywords. Keywords have been the sense for searching literature databases. This research is based in scientific articles about case studies and stories in education.

Keyword: Case studies, stories, education, The Bible, critical source.

REVIEW OF PREVIOUS RESEARCH

Case studies are a research method with purpose to create deeper knowledge in a specific area. The characteristics to case studies are that cases focus on a phenomenon that is difficult to distinguish from the phenomenon context, (Gerring, 2004) and (Brombacher, 2015). Case studies are stories. They are present realistic, complex and contextually rich situations and often involve a dilemma, conflict, or problem that one or more of the characters in the case must negotiate, (Davis, 1993).

Case studies are a well-defined aspect of a historical episode that the investigator selects for analysis, rather than the event itself. According to George and Bennet (2005) the case studies will answer the question how and why by using different sources, (George and Bennet, 2005). A case will have a clear definition and description of the substance to be tested. It must also state the theory analysed to establish credibility, (Thomas, 2011).

Case-based methods are being widely implemented in a variety of learning environments. This method has become a useful and popular method in teaching management, law, history and medicine. During the past years there has been retooled interest in using cases for education, (Carter, 1989). Case studies can be used for educational purposes. Teachers must be able to develop and analyse their own reflective stories to teach others. They concluded that the case studies were effective to create authenticity in classes and promote engagement by tie together theory and practice. The result was that the

participants felt that case studies encouraged developing their skills, (Ackerman and Maslin-Ostrowski, 1995).

Case-based education leads to better understanding of theory, a more critical reflection and teaches students to solve problems. This is the cause of how important the case studies in education (Greenwood and Parkay, 1989). Case studies create deeper understandings and give students experience in analysing data and solve problems. Case-based learning is the fuel for class discussion for teachers and students. Learning based of cases is important in a student's education, (Shulman, 1992).

Case studies means that students gain a greater understanding of analysis, formulations of questions, reflecting on their experiences and to draw conclusions. According to the authors studying case will be a great benefit to the student's future work (Boehrer and Linsky, 1990). A case study research has the potential to deal with complex situation and answer the questions how and why. Qualitative case study method gives scientists the tools to study complex phenomena. The method is applied to help the research to evaluate programs and development (Baxter and Jack, 2008).

Case studies should be a complement to the regular curriculum. The author Allard argues that case study is important to create interest for the students and allow them to discover new knowledge. It is also a good way to practice the analytical ability, Allard (2001). Case studies should be a complement to the regular curriculum (Allard 2001). Case studies are an effective learning tool that treats both theory and

practice. According to the writers, the case-based methods are implemented in many environments (Flynn and Klein, 2001). Case should be used in teaching students to develop their skills to critically analyse. This type of development occurs only use the case in education. Case studying allows the students to analyse and work with problem solving in a higher level. The authors argue that case promotes habits and reflection about teaching and understanding a realistic picture of the complicity of teaching (Comber and Hill, 2000).

Teachers prefer using cases to other more traditional methods and they can also learn about classroom management, motivational issues and mathematics instruction through the use of cases, James (1991). Discussion is the key to success in case-based teaching in school. Case-based learning makes the learning relevant and meaningful. The reason for this is that the students are active through analysis and discussion while they solve a real problem (Christensen, 1987).

Case studies add value to the course literature. Textbooks will help the student to create knowledge while case studies applying the knowledge (Sita Ramanjaneyulu and Suresh Reddy, 2012). Case studies are appropriate shaped for discussion-based education (Gini, 2003).

A story must contain nine points to be a story. The story must be credible and contain pathos to engage the reader. A good story is concrete and based on the audience's worldview. Anyone who does not understand the future can't create a story about it. A story should contain a conflict and gaps where listener can fill in

the story's continuation. Good stories will be identifiable with the recipient (Olinghouse and Wilson, 2013).

Historical narratives are found in all times and in all cultures (Karlegård and Toftenow, 1996). It is the teachers that will create meaningful teachings and true stories to the students. The authors argue that the use of stories in class will create a critical thinking in class. To start thinking process through stories and then that students perceive it as a reconstruction of the past. It is important to be critical in all stories (Fines and Nichol, 1997).

Purpose of historical narratives in teaching to make student become the teller. According to what the writer says the people need to use stories to create interpretations and thoughts about the time we live in (Hermansson, 2004). It is only the teachers who can affect students to learn and develop their independent thinking (Rüsen, 2004). A story contains all the elements that affect a human emotionally (Smith 2012).

The countries stories are based on research of real incidents and myths to fit into the historical inquiry. Humans how writes the story of history has the power to select important and essential information. This creates myths. History influenced by personal factors affect how the writing will be formed (Wadenström, 2005). A story needs a listener. If listeners are committed and recognize themselves in the stories immediate environment makes it easier for the narrator. How the story is played out leads to how the relationship between the storyteller and the listener will be. History is humanity's collective memory. What people do not remember or things people

don't experienced, people must look for traces of the past (Palmer, 2014).

What is the Bible's historical credibility? The Bible has over hundreds of years been criticized and many have questioned the biblical narratives credibility. It challenged the Bible's historical inaccuracies and the myths that have no basis in real occurrence. The first criticism arose in connection with the 1700-century. The edge of enlightenment when objectivity became very important. A researcher would in their work be value-neutral but here we run into trouble. No scientist can be completely neutral, because they choose a perspective in their research topic. This means that there is more scientifically researching in existence of God or to deny the existence. The pursuit of truth was now important. Telogen Troeltsch came up with three basic principles of historical-critical methods (Gustavsson, 1996).

1. *Critical principle – The pursuit of truth is a fundamental principle and therefore may not escape criticism.*
2. *Analogy principle – There must be a similarity with the present.*
3. *Correlation principle – The principle that encompasses everything that happens, happens in an uninterrupted chain of cause and effect (Gustavsson 1996).*

All the incidents in the Bible are orbiting around a living God. God created the universe and maintains order as we can see. The texts in the Bible are recorded testimony that means that everything that happened is true and that God exists. God acts give people proof of their existence. Criticism of the Bible will progress in the

future and what is remarkable is that the Bible has survives despite the criticism (Foster, 2014).

RESULTS

A story is different from case studies because a story is usually written on basis of things that have happened years or days ago, Olinghouse and Wilson (2013). Case studies therefore are aimed to answer question how and why in present time, Wilson (2013) and Gerring (2004). A case study is in one-way similarities to stories in order to manage situations with much information and any type of problem, says Davis (1993).

Case studies are used today in many parts of the academic sector. The writer Carter (1989) explains that case studies are used in, among other things, history- and law education. Case studies lead to, describes Greenwood and Parkay (1989) that students get a better understanding of the theory, which makes the case studies, important in all education. The understanding of theory helps, considering to Comber and Hill (2000), students to get a realistic picture of the complexity found in teaching. To help students to handle complex situations, Baxter and Jack (2008) means, that students must work with case studies. In education based on stories the students do not use the same analysis capability but they learn how to be critical. The person how act like a listener to a story must be critical to all sources, Fines and Nichol (1997).

The listener must be sure if the narrators story is correct or not. Information in stories may contain inaccuracies, misunderstandings and conscious myths,

Gustavsson (1996). Case studies relative to stories do not need the same critical sources because they must state the theory how has been analysed to establish credibility, Thomas (2011).

It is important according to Ackerman and Maslin-Ostrowski (1995) that a teacher can develop their own reflections in order to be able to teach others to do the same.

Working with case can be compared to a catalyst that advocates discussion in education that is educationally for both studies and teachers, Schulman (1992), Ackerman and Maslin-Ostrowski (1995). This allows all participants to evolve, James (1991).

According to Sita Ramanjaneyulu & Suresh Reddy (2012) case studies is provide to add value to the books in education. The opinion of the writers is that books create knowledge and case studies help students to apply the knowledge. Students get the opportunity to analyse ideas and solve problems through case studies, considers Schulman (1992). Comber and Hill (2000) says that case studies helps students to work with problems at a higher level than using ordinary books. Like Comber and Hill (2000), Allard (2001) says that using case studies in education, as a supplement to the syllabus students will discover more and new knowledge.

If the education is based on stories the students must be aware and act critical to new information. A story can reflect on real experience or fictitious occurrence, which affect the truth in stories. The human memory makes people forget which means that historians need to look for

traces from the past, to ensure information, (Palmer, 2014).

Case studies in education makes learning become relevant and meaningful, describes Christensen (1987). According to the writer, the students become active using case studies when they analysis and discussion real problems. Case studies allow students to development thoughts, analyse data and draw their own conclusions, which will be important in future work, according to Boehrer and Linsky (1990).

Human knowledge in stories is based on what researchers are find in the sources that indicate that things have happened. The image of the past is our history. History is incomplete because we don't know everything, we just know which has left traces, Wadenström (2005). According to Olinghouse and Wilson (2013) a story consists experience of real or fictitious occurrence. A story must be credible, contain pathos, involve the reader, be specific and contain a conflict or an issue.

Karlegård and Toftenow (1996) says that historical stories are found in all times and cultures around the world. Stories affect human in an emotionally way and that's the reason why people like stories, considers Smith (2012). A story in education creates a critical thinking, according to Fines and Nichol (1997). Rösen (2004) considers that it is the teacher's responsibility to influence students to learn like, Fines and Nichol (1997) says, develop their own thoughts. In the opinion of the writers the stories create a process of thoughts about the past. According to Fines and Nichol (1997) it is important to be critical in all learning with stories.

A narrative source is something that happens afterwards. The writer Wadenström (2005) argues that history is based on research of incidents and myths. The person who writes the story is the one who choose what should be included and don't. This means, Wadenström (2005), creates myths because forgetfulness or telescoping. A story needs a listener who is committed. An active listener makes, according to Palmer (2014), that human can understand the story faster. Historical stories in education makes, according to Hermansson (2004), that students become storytellers. The writer believes that history is used to understand the world we live in today.

In the opinion of Gustavsson (1996) the bible can be compared with a historical narrative story. Bible has been criticized for its inaccuracies and its myths and the lack of real rudiments. In the 1700s there arose criticism of the Bible when objectivity became more important. Pursuit of truth was now important for the humans. Theologian Troeltsch created three principles to management criticism in historical source; the critical principle, analogy principle and correlation principle, says Gustavsson (1996).

The Bible is a narrative source from a time far away from today. Foster (2014) argues that all occurrence in the Bible focus on a living God who created the world. The writer means that the criticism of the Bible will progress in the future and what is remarkable is that the Bible has survived despite criticism.

CONCLUSION

The questions are can teacher not just tell stories instead? What is lost in stories that are gained in cases?

Both a story and case studies involve the readers to think and act. Case studies in education help according to Thomas (2011) students and teachers to find answers to questions, how and why. Stories help teachers to create a meaningful and exciting teaching. Human needs to act critical in a different way in stories then in case studies because stories in many ways miss sources, say Fines and Nichol, (1997).

The reason why teachers do not use stories instead of cases is the lack of research and reliable sources. All sources that are gained in stories come from narrative sources which influences by human's memory loss. When stories are created by the past experiences there is a chance that the teller exaggerating or loss information through forgetfulness or telescoping, Wadenström, (2005).

A story that is passed on through oral tradition is changing with time. The purpose of the histories is different from a listener to another. The stories changed over the years, which makes the truth distorted. It can be likened to the Bible how is created by recorded narrative stories which less the trace of truth. The Bible is created by stories of experiences from many years ago. That is according to Gustavsson (1996) the reason why human started to ask question about the Bibles inaccuracies.

Today humans have access to all information, which affect us to question the information we hear. Teachers must be able to report facts that uses in education to note the truth.

REFERENCE

- Ackerman, R., & Maslin-Ostrowski, P. (1995) Developing case stories: An analysis of the case story method of instruction and storytelling in teaching educational administration. *American Educational Research Association, San Francisco, CA.*
- Allard, M (2001) *Att arbeta med case I skolan.* Lund: Studentlitteratur.
- Baxter, P., & Jack, S. (2008) Qualitative Case Study Methodology: Study Design and Implementation for Novice Researchers. *McMaster University*, 13(4), 544-559.
- Boehrer, J., & Linsky, M. (1990) Teaching with cases: Learning to question. *Harvard University*, 1990(42), 41-57.
- Boström, A. (2008) Narratives as Tools in Designing the School Chemistry Curriculum. *Interchange: a quarterly review of education*, 39(4), 391-413.
- Brombacher, A. (2015) Case studies. *John Wiley & Sons Ltd.* 31(5), 700-723.
- Carlson, J.A., & Schodt, D.W. (1995) Beyond the lecture: Case teaching and the learning of economic theory. *Journal of Economic Education*, 26(1), 17-28.
- Carter, K. (1989) Using cases to frame mentor-novice conversation about teaching. *Journal: Theory into Practice*, 27(3), 214-222.
- Christensen, C. R. (1987) Teaching and the case method. *Boston: Harvard Business School.*
- Comber, B., & Hill, S. (2000) Socio-economic disadvantage, literacy and social justice: Learning from longitudinal case study research. *The Australian Educational Researcher*. 27(3), 79-98.
- Davis, B. G. (1993) Tools for Teaching. *San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.*
- Dr .Suresh, R. J., & Sita, R. M. (2012) Case study method of teaching in management education. *Journal of Business Management & Social Sciences Research*, 1(3), 13-16.

- Fines, J., & Nichol, J. (1997). The Nuffield Primary History Project. *Teaching Primary History*. Nuffield foundation.
- Flynn, A. E., & Klein, J. D. (2001) The influence of discussion groups in a case-based learning environment. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 49(3), 71-86.
- Foster, P. (2014) The history of the bible. *The Expository Times*. 125(6), 284-286.
- Gerring, J. (2004) What is a case study and what is it good for?. *American Political Science Review*. 98(2), 341-354.
- Gini, A. (2003) Case studies in business ethics. *Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall*.
- Greenwood, G. E., & Parkay, F. W. (1989) Case studies for teacher decision making. *New York: Random House*.
- Gustavsson, S. (1996) Credoakademin art - Kan vi lita på Bibeln?. [Online] Available from: http://www.credoakademin.nu/index.php/articles/article/kan_vi_lita_pa_bibeln [20161122]
- Hahn, F., & Wesley, G. J. (2014) How to write a methodology and results section for empirical research. *Journal of Criminal Justice Education*. 23(2), 137-156.
- Hermansson, A. M. (2004) *Historieundervisningens byggstenar. – grundläggande pedagogik och ämnesdidaktik*. Tryck: Elanders Berlings, Malmö.
- Jacobsen, I. D. (2002) *Vad, hur och varför?* Lund, Studentlitteratur AB.
- James, F. (1991) An analysis of case-based instruction. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. *University of Virginia, Charlottesville*.
- Karlegård, C., & Toftenow, H. (1996) Berätta magistern, berätta!. *Lunds universitet, lärarhögskolan i Malmö, utvecklingsavdelningen*.
- Kallet, R. H. (2004) How to write the methods section of a research paper. *Respiratory Care*, 49(10), 1229–1232.
- Kosa, J. R. (2008) Tell a story. *The Education Digest*, 74(2), 43-47.
- Olinghouse, N. G., & Wilson, J. (2013) The relationship between vocabulary and writing quality in three genres. *Journal Interdisciplinary*. 26 (1), 45-65.
- Orum, A. M., Feagin, J. R., & Sjöberg, G. (1991) *A case for the case study*. : The university of North Carolina Press .

- Palmer, G. (2014) Power of the Spoken Word. *American Indian Quarterly*. 38(4),512-523.
- Pettigrew, M. A. (1990) Longitudinal Field Research on Change: Theory and Practice. *Centre for Corporate Strategy and Change, University of Warwick*, 1(3), 267-292.
- Rüsen, J. (2004) *Berättande och förnuft, historieteoretiska texter*. Tryck: mediaPrint Uddevalla AB, Uddevalla 2004.
- Shulman, L. S. (1992) Case methods in teacher education. *New York, NY: Teachers College Press* 1-30.
- Smith, G. (2012) The Way We Educate: Twenty Million Miles for Some, a Twenty-minute Walk for Others. *Schools: Studies in Education*. 9 (1), 63-72.
- Szurmak, J., & Thuna, M. (2012) Tell me a story: The use of Narrative as a Tool for instruction. *Indianapolis, IN*.
- Thomas, G. (2011) A Typology for the Case Study in Social Science Following a Review of Definition, Discourse, and Structure. *University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK*. 17(6), 511-521.
- Wadenström, P. (2005) Historiefilosofi - Källkritik mot historia. [Online] Available from: <http://www.wadenstrom.net/~d639670/histfil/kallor.htm> [20161119]
- Yin, R. K. (2003) *Case study research: design and methods*. . Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.